

Los Angeles Community College District

**BLUE RIBBON PANEL ON CAMPUS
SAFETY AND EMERGENCY
PREPAREDNESS**

Co-Chairs

**Jim McDonnell, Sheriff
Los Angeles County**

**Scott J. Svonkin, Board President
Los Angeles Community College District**

December 16, 2015

LOS ANGELES COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
BLUE RIBBON PANEL ON CAMPUS SAFETY AND EMERGENCY
PREPAREDNESS

MEMBERS OF THE PANEL

Los Angeles Community College District:

Scott Svonkin, President, Board of Trustees
Mike Eng, Vice President, Board of Trustees
Mike Fong, Member, Board of Trustees
Steve Veres, Trustee Emeritus
Dr. Francisco Rodriguez, Chancellor

County of Los Angeles:

Sheriff's Department

Jim McDonnell, Sheriff
Richard Barrantes, Assistant Sheriff

Office of Emergency Preparedness

Jeff Reeb, Director of Los Angeles County Office of Emergency Management

City of Southgate Police Department:

Randy Davis, Chief

City of Monterrey Park Police Department:

Eugene Harris, Captain

City of Los Angeles Fire Department:

Ralph Terrazas, Fire Chief

Los Angeles Unified School District:

Steve Zipperman, Chief

Professional Peace Officers Association:

Brian Moraguchi, President

Advancement Project:

Connie Rice, Co-founder

National Latino Peace Officers Association – Advocacy, California Charter

Hank Aguilar, President

LOS ANGELES COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT RESOURCES

Dr. Linda Rose, President, Los Angeles Southwest College

Mary Gallagher, Vice President for Administrative Services, Los Angeles Trade
Technical College

Joanne Waddell, President, AFT 1521, Faculty Guild
Bill Elarton, Executive Vice President, AFT 1521, Faculty Guild

Don Gauthier, President, District Academic Senate

Velma Butler, President, AFT 1521A, College Staff Guild

Diva Sanchez, former representative, SEIU 99

Annie Goldman Reed, Grievance Representative, Teamsters 911, Academic
Administrators

LaMont Jackson, Student Trustee, 2014-15

Staff to the Blue Ribbon Panel:

Captain Cheryl Newman-Tarwater, Los Angeles Sheriff's Department, Community
College Bureau

Dr. Adriana Barrera, Deputy Chancellor

**LOS ANGELES COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
BLUE RIBBON PANEL ON CAMPUS SAFETY AND EMERGENCY
PREPAREDNESS**

CHARGE TO THE COMMITTEE

On January 21, 2015, Scott Svonkin, president of the Los Angeles Community College District (LACCD) Board of Trustees, convened a panel of law enforcement and safety professionals, all experts in their respective fields. The charge to the Blue Ribbon Panel was to review the District's existing policies and procedures on safety and security in order to determine the readiness of the nine colleges, District satellites and the Educational Services Center in cases of natural catastrophes or criminal events.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Campus Safety is defined as those policies and procedures which are in place to protect students, faculty and staff from harassment and potential crimes. Emergency Preparedness is defined as those policies and procedures that are in place to assist students, faculty and staff in responding to an emergency, such as an earthquake, fire or other natural catastrophe, that would interrupt the operations of the District.

Members of the Blue Ribbon Panel were requested to participate in two subcommittees: 1) Campus Safety or 2) Emergency Preparedness. Each subcommittee met twice during the spring of 2015.

Campus Safety Subcommittee topics included:

1. Active Shooter Training and drills at District locations
2. Colleges' Training and Preparations Regarding Sexual Assault
3. Behavioral Intervention and Threat Assessment Teams
4. Reporting Requirements on Clery Act and Title IX
5. Physical and Cyber Security

Emergency Preparedness Subcommittee topics were:

1. Emergency Preparedness Plans and District Coordination, including drills
2. Emergency Notification System
3. District Emergency Operations Centers
4. Public Health Issues/Immunizations
5. Colleges as Emergency Shelter Sites

The report includes a series of recommendations stemming from the review of resources, policies and procedures. At the conclusion of the report, these recommendations are organized in a summary table by topic area.

DESCRIPTION OF THE DISTRICT

Geography. The LACCD is comprised of nine colleges stretching from Wilmington in the south, to Sylmar in the northeast, Woodland Hills to the west and Monterrey Park to the east. The District covers 882 square miles of geographically and ethnically diverse communities. In addition to the City of Los Angeles, LACCD’s service area includes 38 cities and twelve (12) K-12 public school districts.

Enrollment. Established in 1969 as a community college district independent from the Los Angeles Unified School District, LACCD now ranks among the largest of community college districts in the nation. LACCD has enrolled more than three million Angelenos during its history. Its enrollment in certificate and degree programs during the 2014-15 academic year totaled 225,000 students. Through its credit, non-credit, life-long learning and contract education course offerings, LACCD impacts the lives of a quarter of a million people annually. (Table 1)

Table 1		
Enrollment 2014–2015		
Los Angeles City College	31,385	
East Los Angeles College	55,118	
Los Angeles Harbor College	13,517	
Los Angeles Mission College	15,143	
Los Angeles Pierce College	31,331	
Los Angeles Southwest College	12,282	
Los Angeles Trade-Technical College	23,179	
Los Angeles Valley College	27,880	
West Los Angeles College	14,856	
Total Enrollment	225,942	

More than two-thirds of the district’s approximately 225,000 students attend classes on a part-time basis. Part-time students tend to be employed at one or more jobs while attending classes once or twice a week. The transitory nature of their enrollment means that these students are not fully engaged

in college life and may often miss communications, such as emergency alerts or Clery Act notices.

Of the students enrolled in LACCD’s programs, 55% are female and more than two-thirds are under the age of 34. Almost 60% of LACCD students are Hispanic/Latinos, 15% are White, 11% are African American, 7% are Asian American and 2% are Filipino. (Table 2)

Table 2- Student Demographics

Students by Gender			
	Female	55.3%	
	Male	44.7%	
Students by Age			
	Under 20	21.2%	
	20–24	33.4%	
	25–34	22.7%	
	35 and Over	22.6%	
Students by Ethnicity 2014–2015			
	Asian	7.4%	
	African-American	11.1%	
	Latino	56.7%	
	White	14.9%	
	Filipino	2.3%	
	Pacific Islander	0.2%	
	Multi-Ethnicity	1.9%	
	American Indian	0.2%	

Mult-Level Administration. The District’s nine colleges are independently accredited by the Accrediting Commission of Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC). Although the District maintains an administrative headquarters, each college has its own president administrative officers, faculty and support staff. The geographic separation from District headquarters as well as the autonomy of the nine colleges means that each college develops and maintains its own operational procedures. For emergency preparedness, however, this means that each college may develop its own procedures for evacuation of buildings and lockdown of facilities. Yet, during an emergency, consistency in management and standardized procedures are essential in order for college personnel and first responders, who are sent in

to address the immediate situation, to act in ways that minimize danger for employees and students alike and to return operations to normalcy as quickly as possible.

Workforce. The LACCD employs a workforce of 5,000 full-time employees and an additional 10,000 instructors are hired on a part-time basis. LACCD's adjunct faculty often have teaching assignments at more than one college within the district. Learning emergency procedures at one college is challenging enough when the adjunct is only on campus to teach one class a week. It becomes more complicated when that adjunct faculty member teaches a single class at two or more colleges. The part-time nature of both its workforce and student body influences and complicates LACCD's ability to provide for their safety and security.

The District's far reach throughout the City and County of Los Angeles, its demographically diverse student population and its complex decentralized system of governance call for a professional police force. Policing the LACCD requires that the force have resources to provide campus safety on a daily basis, as well as to serve as first responders in the case of a natural catastrophe or active shooter incident.

DESCRIPTION OF REVIEW

Safety, Security and Policing. Since 2001, LACCD has contracted with the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department (LASD) for the provision of law enforcement and security services. The LASD Community College Bureau employs 153 personnel, including 105 who are non-sworn, but trained security officers.

While the size of the LASD Community College Bureau has remained relatively stable since the inception of the contract with LACCD, the District has added new buildings with the passage of three facilities bond measures. Since 2002, the District has constructed new buildings totaling 1.3 million square feet, increasing the District's square footage by 22%. In practical terms this means that patrol staffs are called upon to cover considerably more classrooms and meeting spaces in 2015 than in 2002. Similarly, during the same time period, the student body increased from a headcount of 195,000 to the current number of nearly a quarter of a million students.

Although the Community College Bureau provides safety and security services on the LACCD college campuses, three of the District's colleges reside in cities within the County of Los Angeles but outside of the city limits. This circumstance requires that the LASD Community College Bureau develop cooperative agreements with the local police departments of these

cities, but, as has been learned through experience, during an emergency, protocols and jurisdictional authority may not be recognized by external police agencies.

During its history with the District, the Community College Bureau personnel have focused their efforts on patrolling the colleges and maintaining a positive learning environment for students and staff. Surveys administered by the Community College Bureau have shown overwhelmingly that faculty, staff and students feel safe on the campuses of the nine colleges.

During the fall of 2015, through an interagency agreement with the Los Angeles County Department of Mental Health, the LASD Community College Bureau attained the services of two full-time mental health professionals who have been paired with a deputy sheriff, establishing a School Threat Assessment Response Team (START) for LACCD. In three months, the START teams have received more than sixty referrals and completed 33 mental health threat assessments from college personnel and has already shown itself to be a viable measure for promoting campus safety and behavioral interventions.

The Community College Bureau maintains records on crime statistics. A review of the statistics for the 2014-15 academic year shows that crime remained relatively low within the District’s nine colleges. Serious offenses (Part I) totaled 411 in 2014-15 while less serious crimes (Part II) totaled 646 for the same period. With a head count of 225,000 students, the crime rate is less than 1% for Part I crimes.

Crime Statistics 2014-2015			
College	Part I Crimes	Part II Crimes	Total
Los Angeles City College	55	31	86
East Los Angeles College	66	38	104
Los Angeles Harbor College	11	2	13
Los Angeles Mission College	4	10	14
Los Angeles Pierce College	44	25	69
Los Angeles Southwest College	24	7	31
Los Angeles Trade-Technical College	139	59	198
Los Angeles Valley College	49	37	86
West Los Angeles College	19	26	45
All Colleges	411	646	1057

Safety, Security and Policing Recommendations

1. Increase the staffing level of the LASD Community College Bureau to provide coverage more comprehensively throughout the District.
2. Take into account local municipalities and the agencies that will serve as first responders so that training is localized. For example, West Los Angeles College and East Los Angeles College are located in cities that are served by police agencies other than the Los Angeles Police Department.

Active Shooter: Initial discussions focused on campus safety with Captain Cheryl Newman-Tarwater of the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department's (LASD) Community College Bureau discussing recent events and active shooter drills. A newly developed instructional video describing what to do in the event of an active shooter was cited as a best practice and an efficient tool in informing employees and students on effective actions they may take.

From active shooter drills and significant events that have occurred within the last year necessitating campus evacuations and lockdowns, college personnel have made the following recommendations.

1. Communication to staff and students must be immediate and use multiple methods including: email, text, Nixle messages, and a public address system..
2. Building exits must be clearly identified.
3. It must be possible to lock classroom doors locked from the interior.
4. The number of keys needed to unlock doors within any building should be limited to a small number.
5. Emergency phones should be provided in every classroom.
6. Emergency exit pathways must be posted in every classroom.
7. Path of travel must be cleared.
8. Provide active shooter training to all faculty (full- and part-time), staff and students.
9. Develop district wide business continuity plans in place for post incident recovery such as contracts with outside counseling services, emergency equipment, facility cleanup, food, water and blankets.

Sexual Assault: Colleges must provide training to staff to prevent sexual harassment, discrimination and assault in compliance with state and federal laws.

- California State Law AB 1825, enacted in 2004, requires that employers with more than 50 employees must provide two hours of interactive training and education to all supervisory employees once every two years. The California Department of Fair Employment and Housing enforces this law and has the authority to penalize an employer for not taking steps to prevent harassment and discrimination. LACCD requires all supervisors/managers to take online training every two years.
- Title IX of the Higher Education Act, enacted by the United States Congress in 1972, initially targeted gender equity in athletics. Title IX applies to educational programs and institutions that receive federal financial aid. Colleges are required to take immediate action when a responsible employee becomes aware of a discriminatory action or harassment. Title IX requires equitable treatment of the victim and the accused, regardless of gender.

As of July 1, 2015, all institutions of higher education are required to name a Title IX coordinator as well as a victim's advocate. For the LACCD, this means that each of the nine colleges and the ESC must designate and train an individual to serve as a resource for both students and employees. Additionally the District must make training available to every student and staff member.

- The Clery Act is a federal law enacted in 1990 that established a Campus Sexual Assault Victim's Bill of Rights, as well as certain timely reporting requirements. It requires that colleges provide a timely warning about reported incidents that may represent a serious or continuing threat to students or employees even when a crime has not been committed.

Under the Clery Act, colleges are required to notify students and employees of imminent danger as early as possible during the occurrence of an incident requiring evacuation of buildings or a lockdown of a campus as when there is a report of an active shooter. In recent years, lockdowns have taken place at several of the District's colleges because of credible threats received from anonymous phone calls and messages.

Additionally, the Clery Act requires colleges to send out timely warnings notifying students of violent crimes that have occurred on or very close to a college. LASD Community College Bureau personnel

work closely with college administrators when the need for timely warning occurs.

Each college must report annually to the federal government its statistics on crimes defined under the Clery Act and must post this information on its website. Reporting these statistics accurately requires that the Community College Bureau of the LASD and college administrators work cooperatively.

- The federal law titled, Violence Against Women Act (VAWA), was authorized in 1994 and reauthorized in 2013. VAWA has as its focus domestic violence and sexual assault. Its reauthorization expanded the act to include dating violence and stalking. Effective July 1, 2015, VAWA required enforcement of its regulations. New training and enforcement requirements for colleges stem from VAWA.

At this time the colleges have named a part-time Title IX coordinator and the District has also named a Title IX coordinator on an interim basis.

Prevention of Sexual Assault Recommendations

1. Establish a full-time permanent position to coordinate all Title IX training and develop sexual assault awareness programs at LACCD.
2. Implement Title IX training for both employees and students.

Emergency Preparedness: A review of each college's emergency preparedness plan revealed that all colleges as well as the Educational Services Center have developed emergency preparedness plans in accordance with the State Emergency Management System guidelines. Furthermore, in 2014, the District entered into a contract for a single emergency notification system that has text and email messaging capabilities. However, this review also revealed that only one of the nine colleges has an operational public address system that can be used for emergency notifications. With a workforce of more than 10,000 employees, the District's colleges must maintain redundant communications systems with multiple means of messaging and communication.

Until the time this panel was convened, there had not been any discussions internally among the administrators of the nine colleges regarding their emergency procedures. It became evident that emergency evacuation procedures must be standardized among the nine colleges to ensure that the part-time faculty who work at more than one college will know what to do regardless of the particular college involved. The need to train and inform

students who may only be on a college campus once or twice per week was also noted.

During the 2014-15 academic year, the Community College Bureau of the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department conducted an assessment of the facilities and physical layout of the District's nine colleges utilizing the Education Site Survey and Information Sharing (ESSIS) process. The methodology used for these in-depth college site assessments are based on DHS FEMA 428, "Design Safe Campus Projects in Case of Terrorist Attacks and Campus Shootings." The completed reports were uploaded into an Emergency Management system called Digital Sandbox which allows immediate access of the information to law enforcement and fire emergency responders.

Based on the ESSIS rating criteria, all nine (9) colleges were found to meet basic standards. Yet, during recent lockdowns, college administrators learned that numerous keys are required to secure a single building and that, in most instructional buildings, classroom doors lock from the exterior rather than the interior. Furthermore, a review of physical security measures indicated that eight of the nine colleges lack adequate surveillance video coverage. The LASD Community College Bureau also lacks a centralized remote surveillance monitoring system.

In February, 2011, the LACCD Board of Trustees passed a resolution authorizing a lease of facilities at each of its colleges to the American Red Cross for use as temporary emergency shelters. The agreement allowed for the American Red Cross to identify the buildings at each college that can be used on a temporary basis in response to a natural catastrophe. A review of the agreement indicated that the identification of facilities is up to date.

Through internal discussions among administrators, the need for the development of disaster recovery plans at all the colleges and the ESC was noted as paramount. LACCD does not have contracts in place for the provision of emergency services in cases of natural catastrophes. Although discussions have begun, there is not a single point of contact responsible for developing these contracts or for developing a plan for sharing resources such as personnel and equipment at the time of an emergency or for the development of a baseline level for emergency supplies.

The District's occupational health and safety officer is currently responsible for planning and coordinating first aid training districtwide. Additional staff will be required to augment these efforts as well as to prepare the workforce for their own readiness in coping with emergencies.

There are instances of best practices of emergency preparedness but these rely on individual expertise rather than on a comprehensive districtwide system. That LACCD must move to create a centralized coordination unit to provide and monitor safety and emergency preparedness activities was made clear when nine separate plans were submitted for the panel's review. To date, LACCD has relied on the LASD Community College Bureau to communicate among colleges during emergency situations.

Emergency Preparedness Recommendations

1. Establish a Centralized Office of Safety and Emergency Preparedness with authority to implement change and provide technical resources and expertise districtwide.
2. Develop minimum districtwide (or, systemwide) standards:
 - Building Emergency Plans
 - College Emergency Plans
 - Continuity of Operations Plan
 - Crisis Management Organization at Each College
 - Emergency Operation Center Policies and Procedures
 - Regular district wide emergency management drills
 - Situation Reporting to District Headquarters (ESC)
 - Minimum Qualifications and Training Standards for Key Position Holders
3. Ensure that each college maintains a baseline level of emergency supplies of food, water and blankets.
4. Invest in a redundant communications system that includes public address system, landlines, cell phones, email, text messaging, walkie talkies, and satellite phones.
5. Develop a centralized physical security surveillance system with cameras placed strategically in public areas.
6. Model buildings digitally and provide access to this information to LASD's Community College Bureau.

SUMMARY OF BLUE RIBBON PANEL RECOMMENDATIONS

STAFFING

1. Establish a centralized Office of Safety and Emergency Preparedness.
2. Increase the staffing level of the LASD Community College Bureau to provide coverage more comprehensively throughout the District.

TECHNOLOGY

1. Invest in a redundant communications system that includes public address system, landlines, cell phones, email, text messaging, walkie talkies, and satellite phones.
2. Develop a centralized physical security surveillance system with cameras placed strategically in public areas.
3. Model buildings digitally and provide access to this information to LASD's Community College Bureau.

FACILITIES

1. Limit the number of keys needed to secure each building
2. Install interior locks for classrooms
3. Install a public address system at each college that is audible inside buildings and on campus grounds.

TRAINING

1. Standardize training on campus safety with each college having an Emergency Response Team.
2. Require Behavioral Intervention and Threat assessment teams at all district colleges.
3. Take into account local municipalities and the agencies that will serve as first responders so that training is localized. For example, West Los Angeles College and East Los Angeles College are located in cities that are served by police agencies other than the Los Angeles Police Department.
4. Conduct regular district wide emergency management drills
5. Conduct training at the satellites associated with each college.
6. Include students and adjunct faculty in all training exercises.
7. Provide training for students and employees, both full- and part-time, so each knows his/her role in case of an emergency, regardless of its type (earthquake, fire, active shooter, etc.).

PLANS

1. Develop minimum districtwide (or, systemwide) standards:
 - Building Emergency Plans
 - College Emergency Plans
 - Continuity of Operations Plan
 - Crisis Management Organization at Each College
 - Emergency Operation Center Policies and Procedures
 - Situation Reporting to District Headquarters (ESC)
 - Minimum Qualifications and Training Standards for Key Position Holders
 - Behavioral Intervention and Threat Assessment Team operations at all colleges
2. Standardize reporting of emergencies so that the same procedures are followed at each college.
3. Develop a district wide plan to include centralized operations with rules and regulations that every college can follow.
4. Include in every plan certain core elements and use the same template in developing emergency preparedness plans but allow each college to customize according to its needs.

BUDGET

1. Establish an Office of Emergency Preparedness.
2. Employ at least two full-time staff members dedicated to emergency preparedness.
3. Increase the number of LASC Community College Bureau personnel to provide comprehensive policing throughout the District.
4. Ensure that each college maintains a baseline level of emergency supplies of food, water and blankets.
5. Fund colleges equitably to ensure that technology and training are available to all regardless of the college's size and location.



RESOURCES

Disaster Preparedness from a FEMA Standpoint – September 30, 2015
Emergency Plans

- Los Angeles City College
- East Los Angeles College
- Los Angeles Harbor College
- Los Angeles Mission College
- Los Angeles Pierce College
- Los Angeles Southwest College
- Los Angeles Trade-Technical College
- Los Angeles Valley College
- West Los Angeles College

Human Resources Department – Risk Management Safety Advisory

Incident Command System (ICS)/Standardized Emergency Management System (SEMS)

Los Angeles Community College District Emergency Operation Center

Los Angeles Community College District Emergency Operation Center
Personnel

Los Angeles Community College District Training and Preparation Regarding
Sexual Assault – January 21, 2015

Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department Community College Bureau

- 2014 Performance Measures Report
- Campus Safety 2014 Review – January 21, 2015
- Police Staffing History
- The Clery Act: Requirements and Compliance – February 25, 2015
- Education Site Survey and Information Sharing Reports (ESSIS) for all nine (9) Colleges

Surviving an Active Shooter Video

- <http://activeshooter.lasd.org//>